

II/ D4.1 Report on results of task force interventions

IEE/12/708/S12.661214 – PRIMES

Aim of the Task Forces is to provide support to little and medium-sized purchasing organizations (P.O.) for the implementation of interventions of Green Public Procurement related to the energy sector, in order to obtain energy efficiency and CO₂ reductions and to build – up skills among local staff so to promote further replication of GPP in the public sector. The results obtained in terms of energy savings and CO₂ reduction will contribute to reach the targets of the EU 2020 strategy and, in the long run, the promotion of the GPP approach in the target regions will positively influence the development of the local markets towards sustainable development.

The Task Forces of the 6 target regions are composed by staff members of the project partners with the participation of external experts and stakeholders (aimed to provide training, technical support and to promote networking), this means in general 5-15 people directly working together under the coordination of the TF leaders (LEIF, REA, RAEE, ESS, ZEA, LIG) benefiting from further support provided by ICLEI. According to the specific situation, the Task Forces are foreseen to carry on different activities aimed to the implementation of the interventions which, beyond specific technical activities (like identification of environmental criteria to be inserted in the tenders and evaluation of effective solutions for implementation of energy efficiency), can vary from awareness rising and GPP training, to legal support, to collaboration with suppliers and existing GPP networks.

Preparatory activities for interventions

Engagement of project beneficiaries

During the first project period the list of beneficiaries selected at the beginning of Primes (see Table in section 4.a of Annex I) has been revised according to the ongoing situation in the partners' territories so that new participants have been involved and are now committed to the project activities (see “updated list of beneficiaries – month 12”). So far 66 public authorities or groups/network of public institutions are engaged in Primes (further ones are joining the project due to the growing interest in Primes activities among the target regions) out of which 33 have provided their formal adhesion to the project; the majority of beneficiaries are Local Administrations or network of Municipalities, most of which are committed to the

CoM, while others are territorial institutions, like Regional and County Authorities, or local/regional procurement authorities (like schools or public organizations).

Project beneficiaries – updated list month 12

Target region	public purchasing organization involved in Primes	Formal commitment
Zealand	Holbæk Municipality; Odsherred Municipality (NEW), Municipality of Faxe (NEW), Zealand Region (NEW), Municipality of Næstved (NEW)	5 ongoing
Latvia	Tukums Municipality Preiļi Municipality Carnikava Municipality Valka Municipality Grobina Municipality Procurement Monitoring Bureau	5/5
N. Croatia	City of Koprivnica, City of Krizevci, City of Varazdin, Hospital of Koprivnica (NEW)	2
Rhône-Alpes	Regional Council of Rhone Alpes 5 secondary schools (through the regional Council of Rhone Alpes) Conseil general de la Savoye Conseil general de Rhone Network of Municipalities for green gas (around 20 Municipalities, among which most involved PO are: Bourg and Bresse, Grand Valence agglomeration, Albertville, Chambéry, Vill. Sur Saone) Grand Lyon, Municipality of Vienne, Municipality of Bourg and Bresse Ronnais agglomeration (union of 40 municipalities) SDH (social and public housing company), SIEL (+ Municipality of Aix le Bains)	4 + other in progress
Blekinge and Kronoberg	Alvesta, Älmhult, Ljungby, Växjö, Tingsryd, Karlskrona, Ronneby County council Blekinge, County council Kronoberg (+ Kalmar, Mörbylånga and several PO involved during meetings/training)	3 ongoing
Liguria	Albenga; Albisola Sup.; Borgio Verezzi; Calizzano; Celle Ligure; Cengio; Quiliano; Tovo S.G; Urbe; Vado Ligure; Davagna; Montoggio; Moconesi; Serra Riccò; Moneglia; Diano Arentino; Dolceacqua; Seborga; Taggia; Castelnuovo magra; Rocchetta vara; Sarzana; Varese Ligure; Arcola, (Mendatica)	17

Analysis of the potential for interventions

During the reporting period all partners have carried out preparatory activities aimed to identify the potential for implementation of interventions in each region: TF have analysed the current framework of GPP at local/regional/national level (existing regulatory framework, level of GPP experience in public organizations, diffusion of energy specifications, energy labels and green criteria, opportunities offered by the markets, existing barriers to GPP) and have made an assessment of the specific situation of the beneficiaries through the identification of their competences in GPP, the analysis of their procurement plans and the evaluation of their energy strategy, in order to set up an activity plan tailored on the real needs of the PO.

This analysis has revealed that beneficiaries within the PRIMES target regions have a very different level of experience on GPP because, for example, while in Sweden green procurement is a priority for public administrations since many years, there are other situations like in Latvia or in Croatia where GPP is a completely new approach; this means that the administrative, legal and technical framework for

implementation of GPP in the 6 regions is very different, as well as opportunities and barriers. This diversity must be addressed by each TF in a specific way, which can be challenging, but in the meanwhile it represents an important occasion for knowledge sharing and experience exchange among the Primes partnership.

Indeed, during the first project period TF have faced several challenges to the implementation of the project activities, due to the difficulty of beneficiaries to deal with complex/innovative procurement procedures (technical level) and to commit for the finalization of interventions (political level), to non-availability of green products and services on the local markets, to the existence of previous binding contracts still running and, most of all, due to the lack of funding from the PO to implement the interventions; these problems are generating delays in the schedule of the actions in all the partners' regions, therefore all the TF are working to find tailored solutions in order to catch up with the implementation of activities from the next project period.

Activities month 1-12

General overview

So far 21 interventions are being implemented, among which 11 tenders have been already let/ interventions are at finalization stage. The majority of interventions realized in the first project period have taken place in Croatia and in the region of Rhone Alpes, due to the proactivity of the beneficiaries involved in the project (like the Municipality of Koprivnica) or thanks to the opportunities offered by the specific regional framework (e.g. liberalization of the gas market in France) but, at general level, TF interventions have been set up in all regions (from 2015 in Latvia due to the specific administrative situation).

interventions ongoing 21	5 Croazia, 2 Sweden, 11 Rhone Alpes, 3 Liguria (+ 3 planned in DK and 1 in Liguria)
11 tenders awarded / ongoing	3 let +1 ongoing in Croazia , 1 ongoing in Sweden, 3 ongoing in Rhone Alpes, 2 almost finalized in Liguria.

Main activities of the TF have been dedicated to support the beneficiaries in the selection of categories for green procurement, in the planning of projects for the improvement of energy efficiency, in the identification of environmental specifications to be included in the tenders (energy labels, technical specifications, certificates of origin for renewable energy, awarding criteria), in the calculation of CO2 and

energy savings through the comparison with pre-intervention status, in the quantification of money savings according to the LCA and in the identification of specific administrative procedures to implement and finance and the interventions.

Moreover, during the first reporting period partners have organized around 30 regional meetings dedicated to the beneficiaries, thus involving in project activities over 250 representative of PO and other stakeholders (local and regional clusters, other purchasing authorities at regional/national level, public networks and GPP facilitators) in order to rise awareness and commitment to GPP, most of all among decision makers, to promote knowledge sharing, through training sessions and local workshops, and to foster the effectiveness of Primes activities thanks to synergies with other initiatives (Covenant of Mayors, other EU project like “GPP 2020”) and collaboration with suppliers (especially in the region of Rhone Alpes and in Sweden).

The activities implemented by partners are reported cyclically through the “Task Force implementation report ” and the progresses of interventions are monitored through the “GPP assessment table”

Here below a summary of the activities ongoing in the target regions.

TF interventions in the partners’ regions

Croatia

Municipalities in Croatia are in a need to develop knowledge and skills to implement GPP. As all municipalities and local public organizations nationwide are in the same position, there is a small number of GPP examples in practice available at the national level and GPP is focused mainly on municipalities that have signed Covenant of Mayors and have developed or are currently developing SEAPs.

Main needs of Municipalities are to understand what GPP really means and what groups of products can be included in GPP, to inform public organizations about benefits from green procurement but also about energy efficient products and services (there is lack of knowledge about supply of green products on the market), help them to prepare technical specification and set the contracting award criteria, to improve political will, convince staff to commit to GPP and provide huge number of helpful information for procurement and technical staff, also for higher level staff (decision makers).

Despite the general lack of experience among PO, thanks to the effective work implemented in the last years by Rea North and UNDP for awareness rising and capacity building on GPP, the Task force has been able to build on the work implemented so far and obtain important results from the very beginning of the project.

Three cities are participating in PRIMES as beneficiaries and two of them have already signed a letter of intent. With these cities the TF has organized initial technical meetings and went through their procurement plans for 2014: some specific subjects have been identified for green procurement and have been discussed with decision makers (GPP benefits were deeply explained because the commitments of politicians is key for the implementation of the activities), procurement and technical staff and heads of departments.

Thanks to the proactivity of the City of Koprivnica, which is one of first in Croatia to have signed the CoM (2010) and implementing its SEAP (since 2011), 3 green tenders have been awarded by the Municipality:

- public tender for joint green electricity supply (1 year) in 7 public buildings (municipal building, 4 schools, cinema building and theatre) and street lighting in the Municipality of Koprivnica. This being one of the first tenders for green electricity to be let in Croatia (an important result in the framework of PRIMES), main problems were to create technical specification and to define technical criteria including percentage of required electricity from RES and awarding the tender on the criterion of MEAT (economically advantageous tender) instead of the lowest price. The minimum request has been set to 20% of green electricity, to be guaranteed with certificates of origin: this not-too challenging entry level has stimulated competition among suppliers, which allowed the Municipality to receive several quotations, most of which offering higher levels of green electricity. The tender has been published in May and has been awarded with 100% RES electricity (investment ab. 193.500,00 €). The green electricity procured is around 3.550 MWh for all institutions, meaning CO₂ savings 1333,85 t CO₂/year est (according to IPCC standard with 0,376 tCO₂/MWh emission factor for electricity in Croatia) . The tender was published at Croatian public procurement portal:
<https://eojn.nn.hr/SPIN/APPLICATION/IPN/DocumentManagement/DokumentPodaciFrm.aspx?id=4214>
54
- public tender for IT equipment: the intervention dealt with the procurement of Printer 1 pcs, Notebook 16 pcs, Desktop computer 1 pcs, and Photocopier 2 pcs. Aiming to buy energy efficient equipment, the Municipality has included green criteria in technical specification of IT equipment on the basis of eco-labels: as all eco labels are acceptable, the Municipality has used “Energy Star” as an example of condition in technical specification where stands that “Procurement subject is energy efficient IT equipment that owns eco label such as Energy Star or any other same value eco label mark”. The tender was let in July 2014 on the lowest price (6.000€) and all equipments were provided with Energy Star eco label. Usage of this equipment allows energy savings 0,062 toe/year est. and CO₂ savings 0,27 t CO₂/year est.

- public tender for the procurement of 2 electric buses: the tender, completed in July 2014, has foreseen an investment of ab. 186.700 €. Thanks to the procurement of electric buses, compared to a convention solution this intervention generated an energy saving of 1.166 GJ with a reduction of CO₂ estimated to 61 tons.

In the meanwhile a 4th beneficiary has been involved in Primes, Koprivnica Krizevci County Hospital. The structure of the Hospital is a public building with a procurement department independent of other public institutions. The Deputy Manager (decision maker) has been involved in technical and training meetings and the TF is working with the technical and procurement staff of the Hospital on 2 interventions:

- 1) tender for the procurement of solar systems (replacing gas – fuelled systems) – foreseen investment: 48.000€
- 2) preparation of a tender for windows replacement

Zealand

The Danish beneficiaries have following characteristics: procurement function is organized as a independent department in each municipality (with approx. 10-20 employed), the procurers are well trained in the legal framework and focused on the objective to emphasise the criterion of "most value for money" in terms of price and quality, therefore environmental/energy issues are also considered where feasible. Anyway, the general awareness on climate issues is poor in the procurement department and several difficulties in the implementation of GPP are due to the complexity of procurement procedures and the lack of coordination among departments following these activities, especially for complex procurements like ones related to infrastructures or buildings, therefore more dialogue and sharing of information in each partner institution is needed. On behalf of these findings, the main support for beneficiaries must concentrate to ensure coordination between departments, most of all in departments for infrastructure and buildings, to guarantee that environmental criteria and targets for energy saving are integrated in the procurement process.

To this aim, the TF work has organised meetings with the partner municipalities (five in total) concerning organisation issues and planning of relevant interventions with potential to achieve substantial energy savings.

The TF has received and analysed the procurement lists from the Region Zealand, the Municipalities of Holbæk and the Municipality of Odsherred: most procurement do not have energy relevance and for those including energy issues (like IT) requirements are already standardized through existing procurement

schemes (e.g. SKI). This provided, the TF support should be concentrated on improving the existing procurement practice.

The planned interventions supported by the TF are focusing on the following particular product groups: streetlight, indoor lightning and energy retrofitting electric vehicles, bioenergy, (marine biofuel), hospital equipment.

Feasibility studies and technical support to beneficiaries are ongoing for 3 planned interventions:

- Bioenergy investments in the Region (involving Municipalities and farmers);
- Energy saving measures in the hospital sector;
- Maritime biofuel in Municipalities.

Liguria Region

Project beneficiaries in the Region of Liguria are small and medium sized municipalities that have joined the Covenant of Mayors, most of which have realized their SEAP for the implementation of an action plan with measures of energy efficiency and energy saving. Through Primes they will have the possibility to foster their actions towards 2020 targets also in the framework of green procurement: GPP is a topic promoted by the Region of Liguria since many years and, at general level, Municipalities are informed about the benefits of green procurement but so far they purchase green products not specifically related to the energy sector. Here there is a widespread lack of competences due to the complexity to plan the interventions and to deal with technical /environmental specification. To this aim, the TF is working to provide technical support to the beneficiaries so to promote GPP as an effective tool to implement energy efficiency in synergy with the actions of the CoM.

At general level, there are several challenges for the implementation of TF interventions due to the complex legal framework ruling public procurement (national strategy for centralization of procurement), the lack of a national binding regulation on GPP (a new law is expected in the fall 2014), the turnover of local decision makers (political elections in may 2014) and most of all a general lack of funds, due to the financial crisis affecting public administrations, to the Stability Pact and to unforeseen events (flooding of Autumn 2014), situations which are generating obstacles and delays to the municipalities for the implementation of procurements and interventions. One of the task of the TF is, therefore, also to help municipalities to deal with the current situation, for example through informing and supporting them in the research of funding or alternative solutions (like ESCOs) to finance their interventions. To this aim, also joint procurement can be a strategy, therefore the TF is working in collaboration with the Public consortium for

joint energy procurement (CEL), managed by IRE spa, whose aim is to promote energy efficiency and optimisation of energy consumptions in the public sector. Through the consortium, working as joint purchasing authority, beneficiaries can for example procure 100% green electricity with certificates of renewable origin according to national/RECS standard. A new tender of the CEL for the joint procurement of electricity (and green electricity) is now ongoing.

So far the TF is supporting 2 beneficiaries for procurement of green electricity: Municipality of Diano Arentino (green electricity for public building -9 MWh- and outdoor street lighting - 111 MWh – resulting in a saving of 53 tCO₂; intervention started), and Municipality of Arcola (intervention almost finalized):

-Municipality of Arcola: supply of electricity (370 MWh/ year) for part of the municipal buildings/facilities (others are still blinded with ongoing contracts). The procurement foresees an investment around 8.000€ with an extra price for 100% renewable electricity of 0,70 € per MWh. The Municipality has formalized the procurement through the Energy Consortium in November 2014. Saved Co₂ emissions are estimated in 177,6 tons (emission factor for electricity: 0,48 tCO₂/MWh).

The selection and realization of interventions is also ongoing following the organization of the Primes regional workshops which have being organized so far (3 workshop in the Provinces of La Spezia, Imperia and Savona open to Primes beneficiaries and to the Municipalities of the CoM). Main categories identified for next interventions are: building maintenance and retrofitting, also for heating plants (like in the municipalities of Mendatica and Dolceacqua), green electricity and public lighting.

Latvia

GPP in Latvia is a quite new approach: since the beginning of the project government employees involved in the activities admitted not to have general understanding about GPP and explained the need to start with basics. General experience in municipalities is that GPP always pushes up prices, because of non-existing competition, indeed in small/medium size municipalities there are only 1 or 2 suppliers who can meet the requirements of GPP. Therefore, main need for the Municipalities is to have experts and technical professionals to support them in the development of specific criteria to put GPP in practice but, first of all, there is a need to rise awareness among politicians and to organize training sessions to provide the municipal staff with knowledge and instruments.

LEIF has organized dedicated meetings in all the 5 beneficiary municipalities, which in the meanwhile have been asked to collect information on energy consumptions to evaluate the potential for interventions, and two joint sessions dedicated to understand the needs of municipalities, explain the benefits of GPP and set up a joint action plan: on these basis LEIF is hiring professional experts to implement the training to the

beneficiaries and to provide technical support to realize the interventions; moreover, LEIF is collaborating with the Procurements Monitoring Bureau (PMB) and is participating in 2 work group meetings, established by the Ministry of Environmental Protection and Regional Development, to help and give input for the national GPP implementation plan, which is now under development.

All the beneficiaries involved in Primes are willing to learn and know more about GPP and committed to cooperate with LEIF but, due to administrative reasons, no green procurement is possible for the municipalities in 2014, therefore the schedule of interventions has been shifted to 2015. In particular, municipalities have shown high interest to implement GPP in these sectors: construction works (buildings – specific national funds will be available from March 2015- streets, infrastructure), vehicles and lighting. Moreover, municipalities are interested to apply the GPP approach also to the food sector.

Starting from the end of 2014 LEIF plans to make first training session for the municipalities and other interested stakeholders, including representative from the Ministry of Environment Protection and Regional Development.

Region Rhone Alpes

Since the beginning of PRIMES the TF has focused its interventions on public schools, which are managed by the Regional Council of Rhone Alpes, in the meanwhile in order to meet the needs of the regional territory the French TF has started to widen the range of project beneficiaries also to Municipalities and several public entities (associations of Municipalities, regional and county Councils, public institutions) which are now involved in training and implementation activities (11 TF interventions ongoing).

Main tasks of the TF have been to provide to all these purchasing authorities competences and tools to implement GPP (advices and elements for writing in their tenders like technical specifications or selection criteria), to collaborate with regional suppliers and clusters in order to increase the offer of green products and services in the local market (so that they can understand GPP criteria and be able to answer to the tenders) and to promote the implementation of innovative interventions, like the procurement of green gas, despite the possible barriers at political, administrative and technical level.

- Public procurers for schools are quite experienced on the issues of sustainable development (because of participation in several programmes for eco-responsibility and, also, due to the experience of the Regional Council in tenders) therefore the main task of the TF has been to provide them with very practical support to answer specific needs about energy specifications of products/services and awarding criteria to be

established in their procurement. In particular, the activities of the TF have focused on the implementation of interventions for renovation of lighting in 5 schools. Specific training has been provided to the involved staff and a collaboration with the “Cluster Lumiere” has been set-up in order to promote the effectiveness of the action.

- In order to meet the opportunities offered by the liberalization of the energy market in France (gas in 2014 and electricity in 2015) the involvement of Municipalities as project beneficiaries has been considered a priority: the TF is working to support them to face their obligation to open their energy procurements to competition and, in the meanwhile, to implement innovative GPP through the procurement of green gas. A wide and deep work has been done by the TF so that over 50 Municipalities have been involved in this initiative through the participation in technical meetings and training sessions; 20 of them have joined in a regional Network for the procurement of green gas and specific interventions are now ongoing in several of these beneficiaries.

Technical criteria/environmental specifications have been identified through the work done by the TF with the Municipality of La Motte Sevrolex, which represented a first pilot action: environmental specifications for green gas have been identified with the support of existing tools on green electricity that have been adapted on the aim. Entry level for the supply of renewable gas has been set to 20% (green gas has higher cost and no national subsidies are available in this sector) + “bonus” criteria have been introduced aimed to award the tender on around 50% of green gas. Further requests for implementation of energy efficiency have been inserted when drafting the tender, in order to increase the level of the overall supply service (e.g. implementation of retrofitting interventions on public buildings, systems for consumption monitoring, dedicated training service). Due to administrative and political barriers (commitment of decision makers is essential to promote innovative procedures) the tender was not published by the municipality of La Motte Sevrolex but the work implemented by the TF has been used as a basis for the other project beneficiaries so that this pilot tender can be used as a template by all the PO which have joined the network. Among these, 6 Municipalities are particularly engaged in the process and the first tenders for green gas are foreseen to be published by the Municipality of Burg and Bresse and by the SDED. In a further moment the TF will also evaluate possibility of joint procurement.

- Beside green gas, the TF is working to support the project beneficiaries also for specific GPP interventions, mostly related to implementation of building retrofit and procurement of vehicles:

- Support to Rhone Alpes Council for interventions in public building refurbishment;
- Support to the Municipality of Aix le Baisse for procurement of wood chips for a boiler;
- Support to Ronnais agglomeration for interventions on public vehicles;

- Further support to the Municipality of Burg and Bresse for potential of interventions on vehicles, doors/windows replacement and building insulation.

Blekinge and Kronoberg

At general level, among public procurers of Sweden there is a high level of knowledge about GPP and Municipalities are usually strongly committed to its implementation, this means that the Swedish TF has to face a challenging situation to promote GPP even further; on this aim, the TF is focusing its activities to promote among beneficiaries innovative GPP approaches (based for example on LCC and “cradle to cradle”), to widen the replication of particularly effective and complex interventions and to explore also new possible categories for GPP in the energy sector.

During the first project period the project beneficiaries have expressed the desire to increase the occasions to implement joint activities and, to this aim, the TF has organized meetings and training sessions for the Municipalities and County councils in large groups, also through the involvement of the existing GPP networks, in order to promote knowledge sharing and create synergies among the initiatives ongoing in the territory (ESS was also invited to the regional climate cooperation group, to provide information on how to work with GPP and procurement policies and create synergies among Co2 reduction strategies).

The task force interventions are therefore a mix of trainings, meetings, discussions, seminars etc since this is what the municipalities are asking for. Training activities so far have focused on specific product groups like vehicles and outdoor lightning and specific sessions have been devoted to explain and promote the possibilities of EPC.

TF efforts have been aimed also to promote dialogue among public procurers and suppliers, provided the strategic role that pre-procurement can have in GPP; on this aim the TF is working to organize a 3day – training event ("GPP with energy in mind") where to promote dialogue among all stakeholders in order to foster cooperation with local suppliers related to several product groups and services.

A joint intervention has been set up by the TF in order to implement energy efficiency and Co2 reduction in the transports sector, decreasing energy consumptions around 50% from the EU standard: an investment around 250-500.000 € per yea is expected, generating CO2 savings round 500 toe/year.

In the meanwhile 1 intervention is being set – up for renovation of outdoor lightning through EPC in the municipalities of Kalmar, Älmhult and Torsas.

For the next period the TF is planning dedicated trainings on solar PV, green electricity, green vehicles, passive houses/renovation of houses and outdoor lightning.

Feedbacks so far

Barriers	Opportunities
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Legal and administrative framework - Lack of political commitment - Lack of knowledge on GPP (benefits, procurement procedures, technical specifications) and lack of best practices at regional level to showcase - Unavailability of green products/services on the market or higher prices - difficulty to coordinate several participants / departments, most of all in complex interventions (like buildings renovation) - Lack of funding - Lack of personnel (e.g. inside little sized PO) - Unforeseen priorities due to critical situations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Different levels of expertise on GPP among regions involved in Primes - Possibility to train beneficiaries and decision makers about GPP and benefits (energy/ CO2/money saving) - Local best practices available from first TF interventions - High level of participation among beneficiaries and opportunities for replication of interventions - Synergies with other initiatives (CoM, other EU projects, local initiatives) and cooperation with suppliers - Joint procurement as a tool to lower prices of GPP products/services - Alternative solutions to finance interventions (e.g. EPC contracts)